

**1.3 #11** Let  $\mathcal{A} \subset 2^X$  be an algebra,  $\mathcal{A}_\sigma$  the collection of countable unions of sets in  $\mathcal{A}$ , and  $\mathcal{A}_{\sigma\delta}$  the collection of countable intersections of sets in  $\mathcal{A}_\sigma$ . Let  $\mu_0$  be a premeasure on  $\mathcal{A}$  and  $\mu^*$  the induced outer measure.

- (a) For any  $E \subset X$  and  $\epsilon > 0$  there exists  $A \in \mathcal{A}_\sigma$  with  $E \subset A$  and  $\mu^*(A) \leq \mu^*(E) + \epsilon$
- (b) If  $\mu^*(E) < \infty$ , then  $E$  is  $\mu^*$ -measurable if and only if there exists  $B \in \mathcal{A}_{\sigma\delta}$  with  $E \subset B$  and  $\mu^*(B \setminus E) = 0$
- (c) If  $\mu_0$  is  $\sigma$ -finite, then the restriction  $\mu^*(E) < \infty$  in (b) is superfluous.

*Proof.* For (a), let  $E \subset X$  and  $\epsilon > 0$ . Since the infimum in the definition of  $\mu^*(E)$  is the *greatest* lower bound for

$$(1) \quad \left\{ \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} \mu_0(A_j) : \{A_j\}_{j=1}^{\infty} \subset \mathcal{A}, \text{ and } E \subset \bigcup_{j=1}^{\infty} A_j \right\}$$

we have that  $\mu^*(E) + \epsilon$  is not a lower bound, and so there is a sequence  $\{A_j\}_{j=1}^{\infty} \subset \mathcal{A}$  with  $E \subset \bigcup_{j=1}^{\infty} A_j$  and  $\sum_{j=1}^{\infty} \mu_0(A_j) < \mu^*(E) + \epsilon$ . By Proposition 1.13, we have  $\mu^*(A_j) = \mu_0(A_j)$  for each  $j$ , and so by countable subadditivity  $\mu^*(\bigcup_{j=1}^{\infty} A_j) \leq \mu^*(E) + \epsilon$  as desired.

For the “if” direction of (b), first suppose that  $E \subset X$  (allowing the possibility that  $\mu^*(E) = \infty$ ) is such that there is a  $B \in \mathcal{A}_{\sigma\delta}$  with  $E \subset B$  and  $\mu^*(B \setminus E) = 0$ . Letting  $\mathcal{M}$  denote the  $\sigma$ -algebra of  $\mu^*$ -measurable sets, we have  $\mathcal{A} \subset \mathcal{M}$  by Proposition 1.13. Thus (since  $\mathcal{M}$  is closed under countable unions and intersections)  $\mathcal{A}_{\sigma\delta} \subset \mathcal{M}$  and so  $B \in \mathcal{M}$ . Next observe (as in the end of the proof of Carathéodory’s theorem) that for every  $F \subset X$

$$\mu^*(F \cap (B \setminus E)) + \mu^*(F \cap (B \setminus E)^c) \leq \mu^*(B \setminus E) + \mu^*(F) = \mu^*(F)$$

and so  $B \setminus E \in \mathcal{M}$  (above we used the monotonicity of  $\mu^*$  twice). Finally, since  $E = B \setminus (B \setminus E)$  and the latter two sets are in  $\mathcal{M}$ , we also have that  $E \in \mathcal{M}$ .

For the “only if” direction of (b), suppose that  $E \subset X$  is  $\mu^*$ -measurable with  $\mu^*(E) < \infty$ . By part (a), we can find, for each  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , a  $B_n \in \mathcal{A}_\sigma$  with  $E \subset B_n$  and  $\mu^*(B_n) \leq \mu^*(E) + \frac{1}{n}$ . Letting  $B = \bigcap_{j=1}^{\infty} B_n$ , we have  $E \subset B$ ,  $B \in \mathcal{A}_{\sigma\delta}$ , and (by two applications of monotonicity)  $\mu^*(B) = \mu^*(E)$ . Since  $E$  is  $\mu^*$ -measurable

$$\mu^*(E) = \mu^*(B) = \mu^*(B \setminus E) + \mu^*(B \cap E) = \mu^*(B \setminus E) + \mu^*(E)$$

and since  $\mu^*(E) < \infty$  we may subtract to see that  $\mu^*(B \setminus E) = 0$ .

Finally, we consider the “only if” direction of (b) with an assumption of  $\sigma$ -finiteness for  $\mu_0$  replacing the requirement that  $\mu^*(E) < \infty$ . By  $\sigma$ -finiteness, we may choose  $\{D_l\}_{l=1}^{\infty} \subset \mathcal{A}$  with  $X \subset \bigcup_{l=1}^{\infty} D_l$  and  $\mu_0(D_l) = \mu^*(D_l) < \infty$  for each  $l$ . After applying the “disjointification trick”, we may assume that the  $D_l$ ’s are pairwise disjoint. For each  $l, n$ , apply part

(a) to find  $B_{l,n} \in \mathcal{A}_\sigma$  with  $(E \cap D_l) \subset B_{l,n}$  and  $\mu^*(B_{l,n}) \leq \mu^*(E \cap D_l) + \frac{1}{n}$ . After possibly intersecting  $B_{l,n}$  with  $D_l$ , we may further assume that  $B_{l,n} \subset D_l$  (note that after this intersection,  $B_{l,n}$  is still an  $\mathcal{A}_\sigma$  set). Let  $B = \bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} \bigcup_{l=1}^{\infty} B_{l,n}$  so that  $E \subset B \in \mathcal{A}_{\sigma\delta}$ . For each  $l$ ,

$$B \cap D_l = \bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} B_{l,n}$$

and, as in the previous paragraph,  $\mu^*(B \cap D_l) = \mu^*(E \cap D_l)$ . Since  $\mu^*(E \cap D_l) < \infty$ , we have  $\mu^*((B \cap D_l) \setminus (E \cap D_l)) = 0$ . Then

$$\mu^*(B \setminus E) = \mu^*\left(\bigcup_{l=1}^{\infty} (B \cap D_l) \setminus (E \cap D_l)\right) = \sum_{l=1}^{\infty} \mu^*((B \cap D_l) \setminus (E \cap D_l)) = 0$$

□